

Decent Rural Living Initiative (DRLI)

Multi-stakeholder Workshop Summary Outputs

July 2-3, 2018 - Jakarta

This document provides:

- A summary of the areas that have been identified for pre-competitive collaboration.
- An outline of recommended next steps within those areas as identified by those with the workshop.

Decent Rural Living Initiative Summary

Cargill, Golden Agri-Resources (GAR), Musim Mas, Sime Darby Plantations and Wilmar came together with the agreement to identify pre-competitive collaborative ways to address existing barriers to empower and increase the agency of the palm worker. Forum for the Future's role is to enable actionable yet ambitious solutions through bringing different actors across the system together, using a systems and futures lens.

Staged process of consultation decided upon to commitments.

1) In response to: Promoting the awareness of rights amongst workers through:

- Developing a sectoral jurisdictional CBA template with customised opt-in components
- Developing an orientation open-source programme on what it means to be a palm employee
- Improving ICT connectivity for palm oil workers by piloting high-speed internet in South Sumatra

2) Empowering women through data collection and consolidation of best practices

- Examples include obtaining data on the breakdown of the 5 companies' workforce in terms of gender (casual/perm workers) and qualitative, ethnographic data around the needs of women
- The data collated is key to help us to prioritise 1-2 areas from the range of ideas discussed (e.g. contract innovation for casual workers, pilots for alternative livelihoods,

The precompetitive areas for collaboration identified during the Multi-Stakeholder Workshop will now be discussed within each company, with a view to announce a formal commitment by and agreed upon date. This is recommended by end of September.

Our guiding principles

- Go 'beyond compliance' in our ambition, and to demonstrate measurable impact
- Be solutions-oriented in our use of language and the outcomes we generate
- Consider the future-context when considering any challenges or solutions
- Engage diverse points of view - beyond NGOs or companies alone



- Be thoughtful, but also fleet of foot, e.g. we need to move at pace, but not without compromising what will create real impact
- Be people-centred and worker-centric in our solutions
- Be development positive and in alignment with the SDGs

ATTENDANCE

Confirmed Stakeholders

- APINDO Dr. Harjono
- CIFOR Bimbika Sijapati Basnett
- CNV Amalia Falah Alam
- ICCO Kiswara Prihandini and Esti Nuringdyah
- HRWG Rafendi Djamin
- ILO Yunirwan Gah
- LINKS Dr. Feybe Lumuru
- Oxfam Adi Pratama
- DWWG Chris Wangkay
- RSPO Imam Marzuq
- Sawit Watch Zidane Parsaoran
- UNICEF Ann Thomas

Growers

- Cargill - Colin Lee, Nasuha Thaha
- GAR - Anita Neville, Melissa Yeoh, Absa Pradista, Pak Supramono
- Musim Mas - Carolyn Lim, Widya Ng
- Sime Darby - Rashid Redza, Izlin Ismail, Mohamad Pirabaharan, Elly Mahesa Jenar
- Wilmar - Perpetua George, Sandra, Yuli, Memed

Apologies

- BHRRC Golda Benjamin
- Cargill Alexandra Experton
- ISPO Ali Joedawinata
- OPPUK Lambok Simbolon
- RSPO Tiur Rumondang
- UNICEF Lukita Setiyarso
- Verité Daryll Delgado

Conveners - Forum for the Future

- Ariel Muller
- Cynthia Morel
- Madhumitha Ardhanari



Outline of next recommended steps from stakeholders

(1) ACTION AREAS ON INCREASING THE AWARENESS OF WORKER RIGHTS

ISSUE	PRE-COMPETITIVE COLLABORATION	IMMEDIATE 0-12 months	MID-TERM 1 to 3 years	LONG-TERM 3-5 years
Workers' lack of awareness of their rights	To develop an orientation open-source programme on what it means to be an employee. It will be designed to bridge the existing gaps in the 'last mile' of communication.	<p>Identify the format, themes and channels.</p> <p>Identify first topic. Suggested focus is on defining worker rights in context of industrial relations. This baseline feeds well into the subsequent CBA and BJPS work.</p> <p>Develop methodology.</p> <p>Develop guide.</p> <p>Build RASCI.</p> <p>Identify key partners: GAPKI, RSPO, CNV, Gov't institutions</p> <p>Annual sharing of key lessons gained from on-going feedback loops.</p>	<p>Select and develop other related topics.</p> <p>Actively engage with other companies.</p> <p>Continued focus on shared learnings generated from feedback loops.</p>	<p>Securing Government buy-in.</p> <p>Institutionalise learnings across the companies.</p> <p>Ensure that content is normalised in human resource content and training.</p> <p>Continued focus on shared learnings generated from feedback loops.</p>
Lack of capacity for	To develop a palm oil sector CBA template with customised opt-in components. A jurisdictional approach was favoured as	Data collection – can start with sharing which unions	Negotiating the pilot CBA.	Developing the first draft of subsequent pilots.



<p>coordinating robust CBAs</p>	<p>being more inclusive of all relevant parties within a given district or province.</p>	<p>each grower is working with in each region.</p> <p>Data collection also around what workers want and need – from the perspective of the workers – through surveys conducted by Orange Door or Gagimu.</p> <p>Identifying good practices.</p> <p>Holding a multi-stakeholder dialogue to brainstorm around the content and focus of a CBA in the palm oil sector context. This engagement process must include relevant local and regional authorities; local and regional unions; GAPKI and APINDO.</p> <p>Identify the most optimal jurisdiction for the first pilot CBA. Participants believe that South Sumatra is the best starting point as all companies are represented there.</p>	<p>Socialisation (social dialogue), education and training related to the pilot CBA.</p> <p>Developing the first draft of the CBA.</p> <p>Implementing the first pilot.</p> <p>Sharing key learnings from on-going feedback loop.</p> <p>Recruitment of other companies to join next pilot.</p>	<p>Undertaking steps to implement these additional pilots, based on the learnings of on-going feedback loops.</p>
<p>Lack of access to information</p>	<p>Improving ICT connectivity for palm oil workers</p>	<p>Identify key targets and partners. ILO mentioned that Nestlé is running a similar</p>	<p>First roll-out of test pilot.</p>	<p>Ultimate goal is to secure a 2GB fibre optic high speed network.</p>



		<p>programme in Turkey (in partnership with the ILO).</p> <p>Collecting and combining existing data related to data access and usage for the average worker</p> <p>Negotiate contributions from other actors along the value chain and explore the potential for leveraging with relevant government programmes such as Dana Desa, or donors who see the related benefit vis-à-vis monitoring of environmental factors (e.g. fire prevention).</p>	<p>This pilot will be conducted in the same area as where DRLI will be running the first pilot CBA. The Lo-Fi component is related to uploading the handbook. The Hi-Fi relates to all the rest, and interconnected to all empowerment related aspects of this initiative.</p>	<p>Improved connectivity will help support alternative livelihoods related to entrepreneurship schemes through platforms like Bukalapak (Indonesia's answer to Alibaba for SMEs and for breaking through rural-urban linkages).</p>
--	--	--	--	---



Plenary discussion on ‘Awareness of Worker Rights’ in response to the proposed action plan

Regarding the communications piece (the open-source programme on what it means to be an employee):

- Developing an orientation open-source programme could include clarity on pathways to permanent work. It will be designed to bridge existing gaps in the ‘last mile’ of communication.
- The communications tool would take different levels of literacy into account – in a creative way. This component may not be overtly innovative, but could become transformative if it can be replicable across the five companies and beyond. Innovation may come in the form that the communication takes (e.g. drama, etc.).
- Growers recognise that *more* complaints may in fact be generated as a result – especially in the short-medium term. However, this increase may be regarded as a positive indicator of workers benefiting from greater awareness of their rights. It is also an important learning opportunity for the growers to identify systemic issues (e.g. where the same type of complaint repeatedly surfaces).

With respect to the CBA pilot:

- There is no cross-sector CBA at moment. It could be useful to draw one up as a template, as has been done by the textiles industry. It was mentioned that it took 6 months to produce one in relation to textiles, with the focus being on a given region rather than the whole country.
- A jurisdictional approach was favoured as being more inclusive of all relevant parties within a given district or province, rather than just the 5 growers. It makes it clearer to any external stakeholders that the growers are not trying to establish a new standard. This is critical to ensuring that the possibility is there for others to be skilled-up and benefit; a contrast to what was levelled against the IPOP initiative.
- It was proposed to start with small district that is very low risk, and work from there.
- Tiered CBAs for different grades of employees is a possibility.
- There is an added focus in this initiative to ‘consult by doing’, rather than through consultations alone. In terms of starting point, the growers felt that it was important to begin with where the companies are collectively located (e.g. South Sumatra), rather than focusing on where the highest concentration of unions may be. The head of GAPKI (the industry association specifically dedicated to palm oil) is also from South Sumatra.
- The approach is a proof of concept based – you do a pilot, you learn, you adapt, you scale. It is a helpful approach for when you seek to scale as it enables you to engage with new players by saying ‘we have tried this and this and it might be useful for you to adapt as you see fit’, rather than ‘you must do this and this’.



- In the garment industry's case, it was necessary to lobby the Government. View is that palm sector will be successful in engaging relevant authorities, particularly in view of the level of scrutiny from Europe (e.g. re: talks of sanctions against Indonesian palm oil).
- It will be imperative to work collaboratively with GAPKI so that we can move as a constructive force, rather than being perceived as an adverse disruptor. ILO was regarded to have an important role to play vis-à-vis both the Government and GAPKI. GAPKI is a business association specific to palm oil. APINDO works across various sectors, so it is especially crucial that GAPKI be part of the process. FOKSBI is more for smallholders and they have not really looked at labour issues yet, so it might be premature to engage them straight away.
- There is a challenge around non-affiliated unions. It is important to figure out who would represent them or how to engage with them.
- The strength and relevance of CBAs will depend on the **quality of data** collected to inform their focus. The companies currently have some means of collecting quantitative data (e.g. how many workers form part of a union, etc.). However, they have little in the way of *qualitative* data. The growers are open to Orange Door type involvement to inform CBA content. It was cited that an additional platform with survey capacity at minimal cost (www.gagi.com) exists. The work is conducted in partnership with the University of Amsterdam and an organisation called Wage Indicator. They can tell you wages and expenditures of workers. The ones conducting the research are the workers and trade unions. The survey work is conducted via apps on tablets that can be filled offline. They are already conducting this work in the garment sector. Gagimu is the one who brings the tablet or smartphone. It is a nonprofit. Most of the data quantitative.
- It was asked how we might account for the different benefits that we can give to employees. Is there any way of enhancing the BPJS for the sector? One relates to health, the other to manpower. Worth speaking with insurance companies to see what might be possible as a top up? It was said that some companies are doing this already on health but not for the rest of social benefits.
- An issue was highlighted re something that was raised in the last APINDO national conference. The Problem with companies implementing BPJS (*Badan Penyelenggara Jaminan Sosial* – Indonesian Social Insurance Administration Organization) and JKN (*Jaminan Kesehatan Nasional* - Indonesian national health insurance). BPJS is a mandatory requirement as it is in accordance with national regulation. Is this also a similar problem in plantations?
- Issue of institutional blockages was raised – e.g. old format BKSPPS institutional joint union that is government-led for palm oil. In those areas where you still have that arrangement, worth leaving it to one side (at least initially). Build momentum around those easier wins.

Finally, in terms of connectivity:

- DRLI is seeking to take this integrated approach of communications materials, CBAs and connectivity because the latter is of less value if not paired with more awareness raising and means of exercising your rights. Each component feeds into another. Improving ICT connectivity would also have the added benefit of supporting the management of environmental threats, Good Agricultural Practices, etc.



- 2GB backbone – fibre optic high speed networks exist in Vietnam.
- An example of a renewable energy project where Facebook and Google were looking to step in to access X markets. Idea of Telecommunication company involvement has some traction (e.g. Facebook balloon in Africa). The business proposition is not immediately apparent given the low population levels around a plantation. However, there is value in exploring how to leverage things such as the Government's Dana Desa programmes (investment in rural areas); CSR funding available in companies such as Facebook, etc.



(2) ACTION AREAS TO EMPOWER WOMEN

ISSUE	IMMEDIATE 0-12 months	MID 1 to 3 years	LONG 3 to 5 years
Permanent vs casual labour	Data collection to consolidate best practices and obtain data on breakdown in terms of gender (most companies have casual/perm data). Better analysis of this data may serve as an enabler to consolidate good practice.	<p>Best practices in terms of contract innovation around casual labourers – acknowledge flexibility (tailor-made contracts that include some of the key benefits accessible to permanent workers, particularly if working over several years).</p> <p>e.g. Musim Mas wrestles with how best compensate Casual Workers. What they think about is a system where these workers can benefit equitably from the fruits of their labour? There is a need to distinctly recognise the value of what loose fruit collectors (women) bring to the sector – their pay should not be lumped into their husband's pay but be distinct.</p>	Enhance choice and options for women workers – and financial empowerment



		HR needs to analyse the work flow process and track how systems are linked. Particularly crucial in order to deal more effectively with overtime issue during peak season.	
Alternative livelihoods	Understanding existing opportunities for current livelihoods (social impact assessments that they are doing in their operations) to plan for cash crops and other opportunities	<p>Piloting in South Sumatra – identifying partners and crops/alternative livelihood opportunities</p> <p>Need private-public sector partners</p>	Self-sufficiency of women so that initiatives are independent of the company efforts
Voice, representation and leadership	Collect data, patterns, barriers (from workers perspectives) and identify best practices to identify what could enhance women's leadership role.	<p>Strengthen existing gender committees with leadership training and helping them develop their vision with respect to what they could look into and what support they might need to reach their goals.</p> <p>Bring the committees all together to build a network of support, as well as including a component</p>	Grooming female leaders for management team



		where health practitioners could provide additional guidance on nutrition, sanitation, etc.	
Women's health and protection	<p>Raise awareness of nutrition – carb-heavy diet: need to educate around nutrition categories</p> <p>Sexual harassment – awareness on when and how to raise alarm bells</p>	Identifying barriers to good implementation	
Children's welfare	<p>5 growers do a lot around primary education – potential to do more around secondary education</p> <p>Training teachers on broader issues (e.g. concern for the environment) to enhance quality of education more widely</p> <p>Enhanced curriculum for health.</p>		How to enhance children's education in the supplier space – awareness amongst suppliers on what children can and cannot do on plantations on the ground to ensure children's rights



Plenary Discussion on Woman's Rights in response to the proposed action plan.

Highlighting the need for more data before being able to understand where pre-competitive collaboration and interventions will be most useful:

- When it comes to women, there is a paucity of data, in terms of the demographics of women casual labourers and the efficacy of current programmes. As a result, the very first step in the programme of solutions is to collect and analyse existing data. The group also raised the importance of robust qualitative data.
- Specific data needs include:
 - A mapping of qualitative data relating to women's needs and aspirations, what flexibility do they seek, what avenues of grievances do they need?
 - Alternate livelihood options for women according to geography
 - Additional/special health requirements for women
 - Challenges in women's rights for suppliers and smallholders
- Since a lot of data collection assumes women have husbands and families, data samples should account for marginalised women such as single parents and the disabled

Regarding the need for focus:

- In the wider group discussion, several highlighted the need to focus on 2-3 areas in order to achieve deeper impact
- Several highlighted the permanent vs. casual worker issue as the most key issue to be tab
- The need to consolidate and disseminate best practices with a clear understanding of what works in terms of programmes such as contract innovation, gender committees and alternate livelihoods

On sexual harassment:

- A key part of the discussion centred on how there needs to be a lot of sensitivity and awareness on what constitutes a grievance when it comes to sexual harassment. Since it is such an everyday occurrence at many plantations, harassment has been normalised and it is key to spread awareness on women's rights and what constitutes a grievance
- Sexual harassment is also particularly difficult due to cultural norms; women are often actively discouraged from bringing up a complaint by other women

Regarding health and personal protective equipment:

- The consensus in the group was that we were discussing many things and had to be clear in how the five companies could work pre-competitively

On gender committees:

- There was support for the idea of strengthening gender committees, and considering it a priority area. A recommendation was to bring gender committees together at the regional or sub-national



level, given that training and sharing at that level might be profound. There was also cautioned that giving a voice doesn't necessarily mean better outcomes for the workers, so the activities generated by the committees need to be monitored for impact.

- There was a suggestion for a standout campaign on what it means to be a woman on a plantation.
- It was highlighted the possibility of bringing women together in a symposium so that they could work on what they want, thereby putting workers aspirations first instead of assuming their needs – eg if they find cooking to be crucial to nutrition, that should be most tangible next step. It was stressed that we cannot be too prescriptive until we have a collective articulation of women's needs.

On alternative livelihoods:

Proof of concept lens is important in terms of helping identify other sources of income empowerment.

These must ideally be drawn from an Indonesian-relevant context or adapted accordingly with robust local insight.